bae urban economics

Exhibit D

To: Vacaville City Council

From: Matt Kowta, Principal, MCP

Date: July 10, 2016

Re: Fee Analysis for General Plan Update Cost Recovery and for General Plan

Implementation

Introduction

The City of Vacaville General Plan was adopted in August 2015 with Action LU-A6.1, which states: Adopt a General Plan Update cost recovery fee that establishes an impact fee for new development to proportionately pay for the cost of the General Plan Update. The purpose of this memo is to document the methodology that the City of Vacaville has used in order to calculate proposed cost-recovery fees to be collected from development projects that benefit from services provided by the City of Vacaville. The City has, and will continue to provide services in the form of the preparation of the City's comprehensive General Plan Update (General Plan Update Cost Recovery Fee) and the completion of a number of activities that implement the General Plan in the years subsequent to the City Council's adoption of the General Plan Update (General Plan Implementation Fee).

Legal Authority

California State law requires that every jurisdiction adopt a comprehensive General Plan to guide the community's development (California Government Code Section 65301). Without a valid General Plan, a community can be legally restricted from making land use changes and approving new development projects, including functions such as amending the zoning ordinance, issuing land use and building permits, and taking other actions on planning and building applications. Periodically, each jurisdiction must update its General Plan, to ensure that it remains a relevant and effective planning tool. Jurisdictions typically undertake a comprehensive General Plan update every 10 to 25 years. Government Code section 65104 recognizes that the legislative body of the jurisdiction may establish fees to support work including, but not limited to, the adoption and administration of a General Plan, but that the "fees shall not exceed the reasonable cost of providing the service for which the fee is charged." The procedure for adopting such fees are prescribed in Government Code Section 66016.

General Methodology

The remainder of this memo documents the process that the City of Vacaville followed in order to establish the appropriate fees to charge for General Plan Update Cost Recovery and for General Plan Implementation Cost Recovery. Both methodologies follow the same general steps, which are as follows:

- 1. Identify the costs of the required planning activities
- 2. Identify the range of new development that will benefit from the completion of the required planning activities.
- 3. Determine a reasonable method to allocate the costs across the benefitting development, by type of development.
- 4. Calculate a fee schedule that specifies the maximum fee amounts for different types of development that the City can charge, without imposing fees that result in collecting fees that, cumulatively, would collect more money than the cost of conducting the required planning activities.

The following sections explain the fee calculation methodologies used for the General Plan Update Cost Recovery Fee and for the General Plan Implementation Cost Recovery Fee.

Methodology for General Plan Update Cost Recovery Fee

1. Cost

The City's cost for the 2015 General Plan Update included direct consultant contract costs, plus additional City staff support and citywide overhead costs. The General Plan Update cost \$3 million dollars. Of this, \$1.8 million was paid by an interdepartmental loan from the Utilities Department, and the remaining \$1.2 million was funded by the City's General Fund. This fee study is based on recapturing approximately \$2.4 million of the total cost to prepare the new General Plan. This amount was derived by subtracting the cost of the State-mandated Energy and Conservation Action Strategy (ECAS) (\$167,000), which was created to address how the City will reduce greenhouse gas emission through 2020, then by acknowledging that approximately 15 percent of the General Plan Update benefits the entire community (\$450,000) by updating policies related to the Safety Element, the Parks and Recreation Element, and other sections of the General Plan.

\$3,000,000 Total Cost
- \$167,000 ECAS Cost
- \$424,950 Communitywide Benefit
\$ 2,408,050 General Plan Recovery Cost

The remaining \$2.4 million dollars, which represents 85% of the total cost of the General Plan Update minus the ECAS, will be charged to new development areas that significantly

benefitted from the Update. Specifically, new development located within the East of Leisure Town Road, including Brighton Landing, and Northeast Growth Areas, on properties identified as infill Focus Areas, and the Vanden Meadows project would be charged this fee. The allocation of cost by area is shown in the upper part of Table 1.

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	•	
General Plan Update Costs		\$2,400,000
Allocation to Vanden Meadows and Growth Areas	89%	\$2,133,534
Allocation to Incremental Growth in Focus Areas Enabled by GPU	11%	\$266,466
General Plan Maintenance Costs (See detail in Appendix A)		\$4,383,259
Allocation to Building Permits Issued Throughout City Through 2035	100%	\$4,383,259
Total Costs Allocated Through 2035		\$6,783,259

Source: City of Vacaville, 2016.

Vanden Meadows and Brighton Landing, located within the East of Leisure Town Road Growth Area, have Development Agreements that require these projects to pay the General Plan Update Cost Recovery Fee at the time of final map recordation. These developments were approved prior to the adoption of the General Plan, but benefit from General Plan policies, the General Plan Environmental Impact Report and the Energy and Conservation Action Strategy. These Development Agreements also state that in the event the fee has not been adopted at time of final map recordation, the fee is required to be paid at time of building permit issuance. As of the date of this memo, some phases of Brighton Landing are nearing the final map recordation stage. Some phases of Vanden Meadows may be nearing this stage late this year.

For other areas, not currently located within city limits, collecting the Recovery Fee at time of annexation, which is made possible by the General Plan Update and Comprehensive Growth Management Plan (an implementing document of the General Plan) would allow the City to recover the cost of the General Plan Update years earlier than it would in comparison to collecting the fee at building permit issuance. Acquiring the fees early in the development process would allow the City to pay back the General Fund and the interdepartmental loan back earlier. Repayment of these funds will allow the City to fund other projects and obligations.

2. New Development Benefitting from General Plan Update

Table 2 contains a summary of all estimated development through General Plan buildout. The table breaks the total buildout down according to location, and also separates development that is anticipated to occur through 2035, and development that is anticipated to occur between 2035 and General Plan buildout. For the purposes of General Plan Update cost

Recovery Fee, all development that occurs by 2035 (2035 Horizon) under the aegis of the General Plan Update will benefit from the preparation of the 2015 General Plan Update. Conversely, it is assumed that development that does not occur until after 2035 will not benefit directly from the 2015 General Plan Update, but instead will benefit from a future General Plan Update that will cover a period occurring after 2035. Based on these distinctions, as summarized at the bottom on Table 2, total development anticipated through 2035 Horizon includes approximately 9,843 residential units, 1.1 million square feet of commercial space, 1.1 million square feet of industrial space.

Table 2: Development Subject to General Plan Update Fees Through Horizon 2035

	Residentia	Single	Family	Multifa	mily	Comme	rcial	Office	e	Industi	rial
	Units	Units	Acres	Units /	Acres	Sq. Ft.	Acres	Sq. Ft.	Acres	Sq. Ft.	Acres
Vanden Meadows Horizon 2035 already annexed, to be developed	779	779	213.1	0	0	0	0	0	0	C	0
East of Leisure Town Road Growth Area											
ELTR Growth Area Horizon 2035 already annexed, to be developed (Brighton Landing)	780	780	217	0	0	108,000	50	0	0	C	0
ELTR Growth Area Horizon 2035 to be annexed and developed (Roberts Ranch)	785	785	248	0	0	0	0	0	0	C	0
ELTR Growth Area Horizon 2035 to be annexed and developed (Detention Basin)	0	0	23								
ELTR Growth Area Horizon 2035 to be annexed and developed (North of Elmira Rd.)	610	330	136	280	14	60,113	4.6	0	0	C	0
ELTR Growth Area Horizon 2035 to be annexed and developed (possibly - South side of Fry Road, APN 137-020-030)	363	363	137	0	0	135,907	10.4	0	0	C	0
Northeast Growth Area											
NE Growth Area Horizon 2035 already annexed, to be developed (Ashwill Property)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	148,104	8.5
NE Growth Area Horizon 2035 to be annexed and developed (Ashwill Property)	16	16	15.9	0	0	0	0	0	0	409,464	23.5
Sub-total Vanden Meadows and Growth Areas Horizon 2035	3,333	3,053	990	280	14	304,020	65	0	0	557,568	3 32
Focus Areas Horizon 2035	907	30		877		286,771		812,799		1,437,752	:
Focus Areas Incremental Growth Enabled by GPU - Horizon 2035 (incl. above)	335	30		305		286,771		0		0	
Pipeline Horizon 2035 (a)	5,070	3,773		1,297		145,618		0		53,380)
Other Capacity Horizon 2035	533	313		220		446,354		251,944	_	3,123	<u>;</u>
Sub-total Other Areas Growth Through 2035	6,510	4,116		2,394		878,743		1,064,743		1,494,255	ı
TOTAL GROWTH THROUGH 2035	9,843	7,169		2,674		1,182,763		1,064,743		2,051,823	i

Note:

Source: City of Vacaville, 2016

⁽a) Pipeline Horizon 2035 has been reduced by 779 units, as Vanden Meadows is shown separately on this table.

3. Method to Allocate General Plan Update Costs to 2035 Horizon Growth

Table 3 contains the calculations to allocate the General Plan Update costs across the benefitting development that is anticipated through Horizon 2035. Most of the benefitting development is within either the East of Leisure Town Road or Northeast Growth Areas, or Vanden Meadows, with a total value of approximately \$1.3 billion. A small portion of the benefitting development is within the Focus Areas. Focus Areas are locations within the city limits, which were part of the prior General Plan. Within the Focus Areas, the 2015 General Plan Update incorporated changes in land use designations that will enable incremental increases in development potential within the Focus Areas, including increases in single-family, multifamily, and commercial development potential. As shown in the upper part of Table 3, the incremental development capacity increase in the Focus Areas has a potential value of \$165 million.

The middle portion of Table 3 allocates General Plan Update costs new development in proportion to the value of development, with more valuable development being allocated a greater share than development that has a lower value. As shown, the total \$2.4 million cost for the 2015 General Plan Update is allocated primarily to the Vanden Meadows and Growth Areas 2035 development (89% of total), with a much smaller portion allocated to the incremental Focus Areas growth enabled by the General Plan Update (11%). (See Table 1.)

Table 3: GPU Cost Allocation to Vanden Meadows, Horizon 2035 Growth in Growth Areas, and Incremental Growth in Focus Areas

		Total Value	of Development Sul	ject to GPU Cost	Recovery Fee			
	Single-Family	Multifamily	Commercial	Office	Industrial	Total		
Single-Family Multifamily Commonder Meadows and Growth Areas Horizon 2035 (a) \$1,144,875,000 \$56,000,000 \$76,	\$76,005,000	\$0	\$69,696,000	\$1,346,576,000				
Focus Areas Incremental Growth Enabled by GPU (b)	\$11,250,000	\$61,000,000	\$71,692,750	\$0	\$0	\$143,942,750		
Pipeline Total (b) (c)	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0		
Other Capacity Total (b) (c)	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0		
Sub-Total Other Areas	\$11,250,000	\$61,000,000	\$71,692,750	\$0	\$0	\$143,942,750		
Grand Total Development Value Through 2035	\$1,156,125,000	\$117,000,000	\$147,697,750	\$0	\$69,696,000	\$1,490,518,750		
Assumed Value/Unit	\$375,000	\$200,000	\$250	\$250	\$125			
			GPU Cost Allo	cation (Gross)				
	Single-Family	Multifamily	Commercial	Office	Industrial	Total		
Vanden Meadows and Growth Areas Horizon 2035 (a)	\$1,843,452	\$90,170	\$122,382	\$0	\$112,223	\$2,168,227		
Focus Areas Total	\$18,114	\$98,221	\$115,438	\$0	\$0	\$231,773		
Pipeline Total (c)	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0		
Other Capacity Total (c)	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0		
Sub-Total Other Areas	\$18,114	\$98,221	\$115,438	\$0	\$0	\$231,773		
Grand Total Cost Recovery Through 2035	\$1,861,567	\$188,391	\$237,820	\$0	\$112,223	\$2,400,000		
	Cost Allocation (Per Residential Unit, Per Non-Residential Square Foot, or Per Acre)							
Applicable Fees by Area, Through Horizon 2035	Single-Family	Multifamily	Commercial	Office	Industrial	Avg./Acre Annexed		
Vanden Meadows - <u>Per Unit</u> (to be paid upon recordation of final map) (d)	\$604	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.	N.A		
Brighton Landing - Per Unit or Per Non-Res. Sq. Ft. (to be paid upon recordation of final map) (a)	\$604	N.A.	\$0.40	N.A.	N.A.	N.A		
Growth Areas - Per Unit or Non-Res. Sq. Ft. (other areas already annexed)	\$604	\$322	\$0.40	N.A.	\$0.20	N.A		
Growth Areas - Per Acre (other areas to be annexed) (a)	\$1,862	\$6,441	\$1,883	N.A.	\$3,507	\$1,969		
Focus Areas - <u>Per Unit or Non-Res Sq. Ft., incremental growth enabled by GPU</u>	\$604	\$322	\$0.40	N.A.	N.A.	N.A		
Pipeline (excluding Vanden Meadows) - Per Unit or Non-Res Sq. Ft. (c)	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.	N.A		
Other Capacity - Per Unit or Non-Res. Sq. Ft. (c)	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.	N.A.	N.A		

Notes

Sources: The Planning Center / DC&E, 2012; City of Vacaville, BAE, 2016.

⁽a) For Growth Areas, development total reflects the development absorption expected through Horizon 2035. Fees are to be paid at time of annexation on a per acre basis. Fees to be paid by Brighton Landing at time of Final Map recordation or building permit issuance pending the timing of the adoption of the General Plan Update Cost Recovery Fee to the timing of Final Map recordation. Fees are to be paid at time of final map recordation for other Growth Areas already annexed into the city.

⁽b) For Focus Areas that develop by 2035, all fees shall be paid at time of Final Map recordation. In the event a Final Map is not required, the fee shall be paid at building permit issuance.

⁽c) Pipeline projects (except Vanden Meadows) and Other Capacity Areas, identified by Chapter 3 of the General Plan Update Draft Environmental Impact Report, are assumed to be exempt from the General Plan Update Cost Recovery Fee. Pipeline are projects that were granted development entitlements under the 1990 General Plan. Other Capacity Areas include incorporated and unincorporated properties given land use designations by the 1990 General Plan and did not receive new General Plan land use designations as part of the General Plan Update.

⁽d) The General Plan Update Draft Environmental Impact Report identified Vanden Meadows as a Pipeline project. The project was under review concurrently with the General Plan Update process. Per the Vanden Meadow's Development Agreement, Vanden Meadows is required to pay the General Plan Update Cost Recovery Fee. Fees are to be paid at time of final map recordation or building permit issuance, pending the timing of the adoption of the General Plan Update Cost Recovery Fee in relation to the time of Final Map recordation.

4. Fee Schedule for General Plan Cost Recovery Fee

The lower portion of Table 3 calculates the per unit or per acre fees to be charged to benefitting new development. Residential and commercial development that will occur in areas that have already been annexed to the City will be charged the fee on a per-unit basis, and on a per square foot basis, respectively, at time of final map recordation, or at building permit issuance depending on development entitlement stage of each project. For benefitting development that will occur on land that must be annexed to the City (i.e., portions of Growth Areas not already annexed), the fee will be charged on a per-acre basis at time of annexation. The fee amounts are the maximum amounts that the City should charge, in order to ensure that the City does not collect fees in excess of the City's cost of conducting the General Plan Update.

General Plan Implementation Fee

1. Cost

Table 1 summarizes the cost of General Plan Implementation activities through 2035, as estimated by City staff. Implementation activities include, but are not limited to, amendments to the City's Land Use and Development Code, periodic updates to State mandated documents, and maintaining land use entitlement and building reports. The total cost of implementation activities is approximately \$4.4 million. The estimated costs for individual implementation activities are detailed in Appendix A.

2. New Development Benefitting from General Plan Implementation Activities

For the purposes of the General Plan Implementation Plan Cost Recovery Fee, the new development benefitting from the various General Plan Implementation activities is any development project that requires a building permit. As discussed below, the method to allocate General Plan Implementation costs is based on the relative cost of the building fee charged on permits issued. The building fee is a fee charged on all building permits to cover the Building Division's administrative services and building inspection costs. This fee does not represent the total cost of a building permit, which also includes plan review fees, development impact fees, and other surcharges. Table 4 summarizes the total building fees collected between Fiscal Year 2004-2005 and Fiscal Year 2015-2016, indicating average building fee charges of \$1.2 million per year in nominal dollars, or \$1.4 million per year when inflation-adjusted to 2015 dollars.

The General Plan anticipates that future residential building activity occurring between 2016 and 2035 will be higher than the level of activity that occurred between 2005 and 2015. The forecasted increase in building activity is 14.9 percent. Table 4 uses this anticipated increase in building activity as a proxy for the increase in building fee collection through 2035. It assumes that the dollar volume of all types of building permits will increase in line with the increase the volume of permits issued. If this 14.9 percent adjustment is applied to the City's

historic, inflation-adjusted, building permit fee volume, the resulting estimate is \$1.6 million in building fees per year, through 2035.

3. Method to Allocate Costs for General Plan Implementation

As indicated above, the method to allocate costs for General Plan Implementation activities is to estimate the percentage increase in the building fee charged for all building permits that would be necessary in order to recover the estimated General Plan Implementation costs over time. The lower part of Table 4 indicates that if the City simply spread the estimated General Plan Implementation Costs over the 19-year total building permit fee revenue based on nominal historic building permit activity, it would be necessary to add an 18.7 percent surcharge on every building permit. If the City instead calculated the surcharge based on the historic inflation-adjusted building permit revenues, further adjusted by the anticipated increase in overall building permit activity, the resulting cost recovery fee would be 14.2 percent of the base building permit amounts.

This methodology recognizes that the total General Plan Implementation Cost Recovery Fees could increase above the \$4.4 million estimate detailed in Appendix A due to any underlying increases in base building permit fees that may be instituted; however, further increases in building permit revenue will likely be due to inflationary factors, which will likely have a similar effect on the costs of General Plan Implementation activities over time. Under this type of situation, the City may collect more than \$4.4 million in General Plan Implementation Cost Recovery fees; however, the City's cost for the specified implementation activities would likely rise by a similar amount. To ensure the City only collects the amount needed to fund General Plan Implementation activities, the City should reevaluate the amount of development and the fees collected every five years as part of the Comprehensive Growth Management Plan. At that time, the City Council may consider amending the fee, if deemed necessary.

4. Fee Schedule for General Plan Implementation Cost Recovery Fee

As indicated above, the General Plan Implementation Cost Recovery Fee will be charged as a percentage surcharge on total building permit fees collected through the 2035 time period. The surcharge would not vary by permit type; thus, a fee schedule has not been provided. However, Table 5, below, provides examples of how the General Plan Implementation Cost Recovery surcharge would affect different types of permits, at the 14.2 percent level.

Table 4: City of Vacaville Historic Building Fee Revenue and General Plan Implementation Cost Percentage

Building Fee Revenue - Account 1231.41003.000, Fiscal Year 2004-2016

	FY 04/05	FY 05 / 06	FY 06 / 07	FY 07/08	FY 08/09	FY 09 / 10	FY 10 / 11	FY 11 / 12	FY 12 / 13	FY 13 / 14	FY 14 / 15	FY 15 / 16	12 Year Total
Building Permit Revenue	\$1,508,061	\$670,453.10	\$2,235,292.77	\$1,405,520.46	\$1,304,509.24	\$670,717.29	\$819,082.68	\$1,197,289.54	\$1,002,558.60	\$1,055,822.96	\$1,330,945.00	\$1,595,768.40	\$14,796,020.75
CPI	198.80	202.7	209.2	216	222.8	224.395	227.469	233.39	239.65	245.023	251.985	258.572	
Inflation-Adjusted to 2015 \$	\$1.961.480	\$855,256,04	\$ 2.762.830.41	\$ 1.682.538.13	\$1.513.956.75	\$772.872.44	\$ 931.080.04	\$1,326,473,07	\$1.081.717.43	\$1.114.206.64	\$1,365,736,49	\$1,595,768,40	\$16.963.916.11

Anticipated Building Activity Benefitting from General Plan Implementation Through 2035

Nominal Dollar Revenues

12-Year Revenue Total 12-Year Revenue Average

\$14,796,021 \$1,233,002

Revenues Inflation-Adjusted to 2015 \$

12-Year Revenue Total 12-Year Revenue Average

\$16,963,916 \$1,413,660

Inflation-Adjusted 2015\$ Adjusted for Increased Building Activity (14.9%)

12-Year Revenue Total 12-Year Revenue Average\$19,497,915
\$1,624,826

Anticipated General Plan Implementation Activity Costs Through 2035

Total 19 Year Cost	Annual Ave	rage
\$4,383,	259	\$230,698

Building Fee Increase
Necessary to Fund
Implementation, Based on
Nominal Historic Activity 18.71%

Building Fee Increase
Necessary to Fund
Implementation with CPI and
GP increase in activity 14.20%

Source: City of Vacaville, 2016.

Table 5: Examples of General Plan Implementation Cost Recovery Fee

Examples of 14% Building Fee Increase

	Sq. Ft.	Valuation	Вι	ilding Fee	14	.2% Increase	Nev	v Building Fee
Single Family Home	2,248 sf	\$ 253,485.00	\$	1,505.00	\$	213.68	\$	1,718.68
Villas at NV Apartments Bldg 1 (36 Bldg)		\$ 942,404.00	\$	20,359.00	\$	2,890.63	\$	23,249.63
Buzz Oates Warehouse Shell	597,816 sf	\$ 19,090,330.40	\$	50,405.00	\$	7,156.66	\$	57,561.66
PG&E Shell & TI	17076 sf	\$ 6,800,000.00	\$	19,237.00	\$	2,731.33	\$	21,968.33
Reroof Permit		\$ 14,500.00	\$	213.00	\$	30.24	\$	243.24
Solar Permit		 •	\$	52.00	\$	7.38	\$	59.38
Pool		\$ 35,000.00	\$	410.00	\$	58.21	\$	468.21

Source: City of Vacaville, 2016.

Appendix A: Estimated General Plan Update, Maintenance, and Implementation Costs

25-Mar-16

2015 Comprehensive General Plan Update

Cost Allocation Growth Areas Focus Areas

2015 Comprehensive General Plan Update Cost			
Recovery	\$2,400,000	88.9%	11.1%
	\$2,400,000	\$2,133,534	\$266,466

Ongoing Planning Maintenance and Implementation Activities

	Estimated Cost for In-House Preparation (Community Development Cost)	No. of Revisions prior to 2035	Total Cost Through 2035	
Annual Land Use and Development Code Review and Update	\$43,670	20	\$873,400	
Annual Status of the General Plan and Housing Element Report*	\$31,275	20	\$625,500	
Comprehensive Growth Management Plan (Contains Municipal Service Reviewand Comprehensive Annexation Plan)	\$193,538	4	\$774,150	
Comprehensive Land Use and Development Code (Zoning) Update (includes newordinances)	\$387,075	1	\$387,075	
Energy and Conservation Action Strategy (ECAS) Updates	\$44,663	4	\$178,650	
General Plan Technical Update (2025)	\$387,075	1	\$387,075	
Housing Element Update*	\$203,288	3	\$609,863	
Land Use Database Maintenance	\$25,000	20	\$500,000	
Building Permit Software Update - GIS Module (1/3 Total Cost)	\$14,213	1	\$14,213	
Building Permit Software Annual Maintenance (1/3 Total Cost)	\$1,667	20	\$33,333	
Total Cost:	\$1,331,463		\$4,383,259	

Notes: Costs for all ongoing planning maintenance and implementation activities will be spread across all new development anticipated throughout the City of Vacaville within the 2035 planning horizon.

Source: City of Vacaville, 2016

^{*} Includes Department of Housing Services Cost